

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 1**Exposure: lived, worked and went to school in spray zone****Margaret O'Brien****Oral testimony: No**

My family lives in Te Atatu. Throughout the time of the spraying we were radically altering our house and for a few months during the spraying we had no roof over a section of it.

I and 2 of my children suffered chronic illness as a result of the spray. My husband appeared to be unaffected. I was born on 12 .04.1956 at Oamaru and my children were born on 5.10.1988 at Hamilton.

All three affected had underlying health issues which had been dormant for years. I have been an asthmatic since the age of ten, and my children were premature babies who had had issues in their early life. [Triplets born at 32 weeks gestation. Third triplet died at 16 weeks of cot death].

My daughter has an abnormally small windpipe and bronchial tubes etc. This was undiagnosed for years and she was a very ill baby. She now is permanently brain damaged because of the chronic oxygen deprivation she suffered. During the spray period she became really ill again and at one point she was on a nebuliser at home for over 2 months. Long term it has been hard to judge whether there has been any effect as she is not able to communicate properly. I noticed lately though that she seems much more connected, has lost some weight and appears to be learning new things for the first time in 3 years.

My son is her triplet brother and he also was a sickly baby but has been really well for years. During the spray period he got repeated tonsillitis, throat infections and headaches. He also seemed to lose interest in life and became really withdrawn. His school grades plummeted. He was in the accelerant class and now he is in what in my day would be called 2nd year fifth form. The decline was dramatic and he cannot explain it. He too seems to be a bit better in the last few months but his self esteem has taken a battering.

I got repeated throat infections and continually lost my voice. This really bothered me as I answer the phone for my husbands business. He is an Audiologist and many of the people ringing are deaf so the fact that I couldn't talk properly increased everyone's frustration. I also coughed all the time which has done further damage to my stressed pelvic floor.

After a while I also felt as if I had no energy and got a lot of virus'. I was always sick with something and this continued until a few months ago, about April 05 I suddenly started to feel a bit better. I have had a good winter and apart from the fact that my asthma is a lot worse now than it used to be, I think what ever was wrong with me is finally starting to go away. It was almost as if I had Tapanui flu. Nothing showed up in the many tests which were run. I stopped donating blood during this period as I felt uneasy about the spray and its affects. I am O neg so they want my blood.

My bank statements for the period of the spray are full of Drs consultations and pharmacy payments. As we run a business I have kept all bank statements and I would be happy to get these out to support my statement.

At first I thought it was only the throat infections and voice loss that I could attribute directly to the spray but now I believe my immune system took such a hammering that I did get some sort of auto immune syndrome. The chronic lack of energy and inability to work were so out of character. I seldom get sick but I was sick all the time with odd fevers and flus.

I don't really know what my children felt like as my daughter couldn't say and my son didn't say except to say he didn't know what was wrong with him.

I often wonder if the Te Atatu South Area got more spray than other areas as many of my neighbours also seemed to be sick all the time with sore throats and breathing problems. None of them could recall being like that for so long a period before in their life either. The planes seemed to come down really low and once I thought he would hit my house it was so close. I can remember being drenched by the spray several times

while I was working outside and having to rewash clothes and cars repeatedly as the spraying occurred well outside the guideline times. Also as we had no roof on part of the house for a few months the spray got into the house and possibly had more opportunity to affect us.

It has been an interesting for me throughout this experience as I do favour eradication of threats to our economy. I could not understand why the moth was allowed to spread as widely as it did. I supported the spraying and I believed MAF when they said it was safe. As I got sicker and sicker I really felt that something must be done to recognise the sickness that it was causing and to warn the population about it. I got to the stage where I would not go out at all on a spray day, but the children had to go to school. In the spraying in November and December the children became quite sick even tho the weather was fine and sunny. My Doctor (Donovan Street Medical Centre) said he was usually really quiet in Nov-Dec but he was seeing people he never saw and was as busy as the middle of winter.

My brother in Law who has a PHD in Chemistry and teaches at the University of Western Australia said he didn't think the active ingredients in the spray should do me too much harm as I am not allergic to any of them but he said to make it suitable for air spraying they mix the spray which is alkaline with an acid to make it suitable for the equipment. If they overdid the acid it could cause the burning throats and rashes that people describe. Of course the acid is not mentioned in the ingredients so is not tested for. If the immune system is repeatedly attacked in a short period sometimes it cannot cope and this is what I think happened to me. I now believe I am recovering.

Every person had a different experience of the spray. Even though we were supposedly sprayed about 28 times I believe I was sprayed many more times than that as I initially made no effort to keep out of its way. I went out and some days my car was sprayed 3 or 4 times. I also gardened as it was a terribly wet period and the spraying happened only on fine days. We were all outside on those days doing washing and yard work as there were so few fine days. My husband worked a lot of the time outside the spray area so may have been much less affected. The children went to school in the spray zone and of course were home sick a lot so got extra exposure.

That's all I have to say. I hope the enquiry puts an end to the condescending attitude of the ministry, and the propoganda about the spray being totally safe. If reasonable warnings were given and the population were treated with some respect I believe a lot of misery would have been avoided.

POST-INQUIRY - POSTSCRIPTS

Jan 2007: I was so sick in the years the spraying took place even in the summer when people are usually healthy. My twins now aged 18 were sick also. They have been a lot better since the spraying stopped.

I have been diagnosed with polycystic kidney disease which is quite advanced. Prior to the spraying I had never had any symptoms of this but now it is significant. It is congenital but often lies dormant. It is strange I feel that mine went from nothing to quite advanced – hundreds of cysts in two years, I feel this could have been because my immune system was so compromised.

October 2007:

In the last 2-3 years we have all had no tonsillitis or throat infection, no chest infections and no other illnesses which defy explanation.

My daughter is quite well now and is learning again. My son sort of caught up at school and scraped through NCEA level 3. He is now at Auckland University and doing OK. They are 19 now.

I am OK most of the time but I still have health issues because of the polycystic kidney disease. Tiredness and depression seem to be the main problems, but I have noticed lately that I am feeling a lot better and I am finally starting to catch up on all the things that have not been done because of my illnesses.

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

I will never know whether the spraying contributed to the onset of the polycystic kidney disease but I know I was really run down and ill for about two years with throat infections and coughing. I felt dreadful and I thought my daughter was in serious trouble. I got her a nebulizer and used it often. She got so sick. She hadn't been like that since she was 3 or 4. She has now fully recovered and has nothing wrong with her. I had her tested extensively last year to make sure.

My son is still really thin and seems to get sick easily, but he is young and keeps odd hours and doesn't eat as well as he should. He is flattening at the moment which aggravates his health problems. He is coming home for the summer and I hope his health will improve with proper food.

It is hard to say categorically that the spray caused long term harm but we all were really sick for quite a while and even though we have recovered, damage was done. My son's interest in school fell away and his personality changed. He was sick all the time, my daughter was sick all the time, I felt dreadful. Work suffered as only the minimum was done and I am still finding and sorting out errors which were made all that time ago.

Like any event you live through it is difficult to quantify what harm was done but I believe we were made sick by the spray and I believe the various methodologies used by the ministry or government to evaluate the damage caused have all been set to get the required result, ie that no long term harm has been done.

I thank you again for all your work. I don't believe that the suffering of hundreds of people will ever be officially recognised, but that is not going to stop me having my say.

End

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 2
Exposure: lived and worked in spray area
Jenni Boulton
Oral testimony: Yes

(Note: Jenni has structured her submission around the registration categories – see Appendix A for copy of the Registration & Submission Form. The category titles have been added for ease of reading)

December 2005
Dear People's Inquiry

I'm writing from memory. Unfortunately I didn't keep a diary. However I believe my record is an accurate account from a spray victim's perspective. I hope it is readable. Please get back to me if I can clarify any points.

Part A: Health Effects and impacts

Dr T is investigating my spray illnesses on behalf of the then Associate Minister's of Health behalf (Pete Hodgson MP). With his permission I am using these edited responses as my submission in the health effects and impacts of the Painted Apple moth programme. Below are copies of my emails to Dr T.

22 October 2005
Dear Dr T

I'm sorry for the delay in responding to you. I have been very sick this week.
 (No 2) I am happy for you to direct your inquiries directly to my GP. I only have records of the medication given/GP visits.

Just briefly:

I was brushing my teeth in front of a slightly open window in January 2002 when Maf hit me first with Foray 48B. I developed weeping open sores on my lower face and a mucus discharge from my nose.

During the first part of the spray programme I suffered earache for the first time in my life. I found it difficult to hear conversational speech. After the spray programme ended I heard a 'pop' in my left ear. My hearing improved, but is still slightly impaired. During the spray I couldn't hear cars approaching me in parking lots. I once looked around to see a car bumper just behind my knees. Also when I was driving I couldn't localise which direction car horns were coming from and I couldn't judge how closely cars were to me. In a parking lot I almost backed into a car that was beeping at me.

I have lived with chronic sinus pain since 4.30pm on the 24th October 2002. The only time I am unaware of this pain is when I sleep. Sometimes during the spraying years the pain was so severe I woke up. I remember waking up to the pain one morning just in time to clean my son's blood nose.

I suffered weeks of nausea when Maf sprayed [...] School on the 24th October 2002. My period began in the middle of the cycle for the first and only time in my life. I suffered severe symptoms of PMS. I continued to suffer torrential type periods until I got out of direct spray in February 2003.

By December my gums were bleeding badly and I developed a persistent cough. I still have this cough. My GP recently gave me an inhaler. I find this manages the problem quite well. I lost my sense of smell in January 2003, the same time I began to develop breathing difficulties. My head felt as though it was completely full of mucus. During the summer holidays I coughed up mucus, ran out of breath easily (even when doing the dishes or making the beds), and suffered increasing sinus problems on spray days even although our home was not sprayed.

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

I now suffer an almost constant burning sensation in my throat and upper lungs. The only time this sensation eases is at home. I seem to react badly to the carpet in my classroom. The first time I experienced this pain was in April 2003. I got out of my car at the Ranui bakery after 8am. It was such a powerful reaction I still clearly remember it: it felt like a red hot iron bar down being thrust down my throat.

I can't wear makeup. It itches and burns and causes open sores. The sores take ages to heal and then leave a scar that takes ages to fade. I sometimes use my son's Clearasil products on my face to wash my skin. They seem to be OK, but not the Clearasil daily face wash which burns.

I cough and choke eating supermarket potato salad, cheesecake and once had a severe fit using plant based shampoo. Later I looked closely at the fine print on the shampoo bottle and saw that the shampoo had a spray preservative. Other times I can eat cheesecake or drink a little wine. But every time I approach a processed food it is with a great deal of caution.

When I was working at [...] Primary School in 2003 the cleaner came into my room at 3pm. I started to cough as soon as the cleaner entered the building. On one occasion I felt mucus drop from my nose to my lungs via the back of the throat almost immediately. During 2002 I had a good relationship with the cleaner at [...] school. She was incredibly kind and tipped out her cleaning water and used the plant based cleaners I gave her.

I had a friendly relationship with the 2003-2004 [...] school cleaners too, but I didn't like to ask them to go to so much bother on my behalf...they seemed so busy and rushed off their feet. At the moment I teach at [...] school. I leave the room immediately when the cleaner comes in with the sprays. He comes in later, so it is not such a problem.

I also suffered visual problems during the spray. I lost my vision behind the steering wheel as I drove through Ranui/Swanson in February 2003. It was not a spray week. Maf had ground sprayed at Glendene earlier that same week. I also almost lost my vision in October 2002 on the North Western Motorway. I could see enough to get off the motorway and let my eyes stream until I could see well enough to continue.

I also suffered incidents of blurred vision. Once while driving I almost collected a driver leaving his parked car on the main road of Henderson... I was going to church. At church everything blurred. I thought I might have to catch a taxi home. But my vision returned to normal after about 15 minutes.

One other occasions I turned left, couldn't see cars from my right, put on my brakes: on one occasion I was hit from behind. On another occasion I ran into a metal pole. I believe I was sick and disorientated. The previous night I had collapsed on the balcony when I took my dogs out in the middle of the night. I lay with my face pressed against the wet wood. It felt as if my lungs were flat.

Also in February 2003 I remember the feeling of there being holes in my lungs. When there was a cold wind it felt as if the air was just passing through the walls of my lungs. I did go to an asthma specialist, Mercy hospital and Greenlane Hospital for a lung x-ray. The asthma specialist report is filed with the Waitakere City Council as they kindly paid for my visit. The asthma specialist said I had a virus. Maf Health wrote in their report to Hamilton that I was one of three west Aucklanders who did not have asthma.

I think I have covered all my spray effects. I still feel pressure on my lungs. Even when I stand up it feels as if a weight is pressing against my lungs. I am chronically tired. I went to a gym for quite some time because I read in Time magazine the best thing to do for lung disease is to exercise (and because I wanted to lose weight). I had to leave recently because I reacted to the air fresheners: my throat and lungs burnt and I suffered muscle spasms (strangely).

I also suffer muscle spasms now if I am foolish enough to read a newspaper. This is a very strange sensation. I have never experienced anything quite like it before. My eyes can water and sting and my cough can return. Sometimes I sneeze. I no longer read paperbacks. I avoid doing too much school work too late at night. I prefer to do my paperwork in a well ventilated area.

The only other symptom I suffer from is a broken heart. I can't believe people can be so cruel to other humans. I don't believe I am the first to suffer these effects. I'm very gullible. I believed everything that was told to me until October 2002. I no longer then had vague suspicions about the spray effects.

By December 2002 I felt so sick, I felt as if I was dying. But again foolishly returned to work in January 2003. I even stupidly returned to work for a staff meeting in February 2003. I started to have an 'asthma' type attack as soon as I entered the foyer of the base school. During this time I was asked on a couple of occasions if I had asthma. My GP tells me I do not have asthma. He's told me that I have severe allergies. It's taken a long time to get this diagnosis and appropriate medication to help me.

The initial anti histamines no longer seem to work. The most recent make me too sleepy to work. At the moment I am considering naturopathy to clear the histamines from my body. I am waiting for a refund of my GP expenses so that I could do this.

I'm sorry...this report hasn't turned out to be so brief after all. I think I covered everything except the possible stroke and the chest pain.

I once (2003) thought I was hallucinating. I was turning right into Te Atatu Road. The road was empty. Then a car 'materialised' in front of my eyes. I tried to explain this to the asthma specialist. Later I wondered if I had a brief seizure. I was going to my son's school for an IEP meeting. When I arrived I couldn't breathe and had to lean against the side of the building. My son tried to hit me to help me to breathe. When we got to the meeting my son's teacher was in sick bay with a blood nose.

Perhaps because of all the coughing I did develop severe chest pains. It felt as if I had broken a rib. Later when I took the headache medication, sinus medication and asthma medication I felt sharp hot thin pain from the centre of my chest shoot down to the left. I couldn't move. This happened at school (on asthma medication only) and at home.

I am very sorry I haven't kept a diary of my health effects. I tend just to brush things off. I never anticipated these severe and ongoing effects. I forgot to mention severe headaches, associated with sinus pain. I still get these sometimes.

I guess the reason I am so sure that these are spray effects is that I have never suffered sinus, or earache before. I have never suffered from a known allergy. If I was allergic to anything I had no awareness of it. When I lost my sense of smell it felt as if someone had hit my face with a rubber mallet. I stepped out of my car at work into the spray, and 'whoosh' I no longer could smell (a little sense is now returning: curry and dog fluffs). When I first suffered sinus pain I was driving into Henderson after a heavy day of spray at [...] school. I felt as if someone had put a heavy rubber band across my nose. One moment I wasn't in pain; the next moment I was (and still am). Except for one infection in my twenties I have never suffered lung problems. Now I can't blow up balloons. I remember the headache I had in July 1986 because it was such a rare occurrence.

(No 3) My son had one final blood nose after the end of the spray programme. (Possibly coinciding with a Council verge spray.) We approached our GP on this occasion. The blood noses cleared up spontaneously. He did however attend Waitakere hospital for two follow up visits. On the first visit his nose was cauterised. These blood noses were extremely severe. Blood filled both eye sockets. Once he asked me to take a photo. Unfortunately this photo would not download from the camera.

I would have suspected his nose would have bled at his school dance. The air in the hall was so hot my glasses fogged up. Later I could hear the squelch of sweat inside his shoes. He held up his feet to my nose in the car. I couldn't smell a thing...but I remember being surprised that the heat hadn't triggered a blood nose. However towards the end of the spraying his nose bled almost two days after each spray. We lived between two hot spots. I needed to replace his bedding.

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Earlier in April 2003 my son vomited and hallucinated under Maf planes. We were then directly under the path of Maf planes approaching Ranui/Swanson hotspot. The vomit was clear and copious with bits of food in it. My son only described the hallucinations as 'comic book'. My son has never before or since hallucinated. He has never vomited up clear bile, nor ever only vomited once. My dog, who later died of liver cancer, had a similar vomit before she died (although her vomit was yellow).

(No. 1) I only gave Hodgson permission to investigate my health concerns; however the children's deaths are a fact. These children died coincidentally to the last year of the spray programme. I do not have the parent's permission to tell their stories. Could you investigate their deaths without my help? When the first child died I was asked not to approach the parents. I can understand this. Would I be allowed to give you a copy of our newsletters? The children's names and times of death are recorded there. Would I be stepping outside of the ethical considerations of my teaching profession if I helped you this way?

I began working with children with profound and severe disabilities in 1984. I was a member of the working party that assisted these children to move from the hospital and IHC preschool centres into our special schools. I believe the number of children dying of what I regard as observable spray effects is unusual. Our principal stated in a staff meeting that some of these children were frail, but others were robust. Only two of my extremely frail 1985-1988 children have died. Frailty and disability doesn't necessary mean keeling over in childhood.

(No. 2) My student's mother attached a letter documenting her son's spray effects to my affidavit to the Hamilton High Court (October 2003)*. Maf health eventually became involved in this family in 2003. I would be happy to approach her as a friend to see if she would speak to you.

(No 5) My colleague with a burst eardrum and a sick child is also on Maf file. I taught with her at [..] Primary School in 2002. My colleague attached a letter to my affidavit to the Hamilton High Court (October 2003).

[Case taken by a Community Group against MAF in the High Court to prevent the aerial spraying of Hamilton against a supposed infestation the Asian Gypsy Moth]*

23 October 2005

Dear Dr T - Re: oops a mistake and some omissions

I ran over the school fence, not the metal pole the day after I collapsed on the balcony. If you go to [..] school you will know the fence I mean. It had to be bolted back into the concrete. I back into a wooden railing everyday before I go to work in my own property. I have never ploughed into it. I do not have a history (if you discount my teenage years) of running into or over things. I ran into the metal pole earlier in the year. That was the same week I got out of the car to go into the Ranui Bakery and felt the searing pain in my throat and lungs. It was a very severe blow to the car. It turned the rear of my car into a v shape and damaged the lock on my boot. My car is usually quite tough. The car that ran into me when I stopped suddenly also was quite badly damaged. I only got a dent. So I really banged into that pole.

I forgot to mention I developed pins and needles in my lips when I returned to work in 2003. After the spray I only developed this symptom twice. Once in Onehunga near the port (I was also having trouble breathing) and once when I ate a Summerhouse tomato. As soon as I tasted the tomato the tip of my tongue went numb and my lips began to 'pins and needle'. I got the same Foray 48B burning sensation in my throat. Summerhouse responded to my concerns by informing me that Bt sprays were part of their pest management strategies. During the worst of the spray (2003) I used to wake up with my lips tingling.

The other symptom I forgot to mention was the muscle pain in my arm. The pain ran from my wrist to my elbow on the inside of my arm. This only happened at the beginning of 2003 when I returned to work in the spray.

Maf sprayed my son in the playground on the first day of the spring spray in October 2002. Maf had sprayed the school in the morning and the teachers probably thought the spray was over. Maf got him as he was at

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

the tuck shop with his hotdog in his hand. My son ate his lunch anyway and coughed from that day until December 19th 2002. When he got home after being sprayed he was breathing like Darth Vader. I kept him at home on spray days after that. (I don't blame the teachers for allowing him to leave the classroom. They probably got the same letter I sent home with my students. The letter stated that the schools would only be sprayed once and that the school would not be caught in spray drift. Later In January 2003 I counted 7 passes in 45 minutes.)

Although my son seems to have shaken off his spray experience I have a concern about two incidents that happened. In one incident I was eating nachos (coughing and choking but still determined to eat them) when he asked me to close the bag because the air was thick and he couldn't breathe. The other incident happened this year when I put a new unassembled computer table into his room. He complained of headaches. When I removed the cheap, particleboard table from his room the headaches ceased.

Part B: Economic, social and community impacts

The economy has lost my son and me.

I care nothing for this country now.

Previously I gave my time to the community and a significant amount of money to community concerns.

I now plan to leave New Zealand. My passion, my love will be given to another nation.

I asked my son whom he would have voted for in the last election. He responded, "I don't care. New Zealand can go to hell. I won't be here to see it."

Can a nation afford to lose it's young?

Part C: Human rights

My lungs have been raped.

My body has been assaulted.

The information campaign lied to me about the short and long term effects of the spray. The Di Marco study stated that "estimated exposures are too low to cause any irritation of mucous membranes, eyes or the skin which is the only clearly demonstrated hazard of Foray 48B." (In February 2003 I lost my vision behind the steering wheel to the Di Marco non effect.)

I have been stolen from. Maf have refunded zero cents of my medical expenses. Maf have given me no explanation for their non-payment.

Part D: Maf operational conduct and impacts

Maf sprayed me at 11am on a school day. Their scheduled spray was 1pm. The caretaker rang to complain. Maf said they had not sprayed. (November 11th 2002) I had to walk through this spray. I became severely ill: I lost weight quickly, became nauseous, disoriented and tired. Effects lasted approximately three weeks.

Maf gave me a message on the answer phone in the early hours of the morning. I wasn't able to clear it until 7.45: Too late for me to avoid the drive through the sprayed area. Too late for me to ring my employer. (I have a copy of this message on my SIM card.)

Maf advertised spray schedule in Friday papers. Friday papers are not delivered. I did not realise until almost the end of the spray programme that I needed to pick up a copy from the dairy.

Maf called their Massey spray "Riverhead." I had no idea my church was in the sprayed area. I continued to attend church in this area despite sinus pain. I also found the maps of spray areas blurred. Clearer maps were available at work. One work site hid the map under other pieces of paper on the notice board. Another work site gave me an unopened package which contained out of date information. Maf could not be sure that

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

all west Aucklanders were informed. I requested a warning phone call earlier on in the programme. Maf refused. Later I was on their mobile alert (see above).

I rang the Maf hotline on December 22nd 2002. I told the nurse about how sick I was. I told her about my son who had been coughing for almost two months. The nurse suggested I might be allergic to soy, corn or fish. Kelly rang me back on March 11th 2003 to check what my plans were for the next spray. By March 11th I had also developed breathing difficulties and symptoms of toxic shock (pins and needles in my lips, blurred vision, tendonitis type pain).

When I rang the Maf hotline on December 22nd 2002 I told the nurse on the Maf hotline about the children's illnesses (I teach). The nurse was silent. Later I spoke to the same nurse in March/April 2003 about my concerns for a sick child in my room (now under investigation by Dr T / mother attached a letter to my October 2003 affidavit to the Hamilton High Court). The same nurse replied, "Are you aware of what is in the spray?" I cut her off. I didn't have patience for this patronising twaddle.

Part E: Government and Maf policy, legislation, process and conduct

As far as I can understand Government/Maf have the power to spray us with any chemical they deem necessary on only 24 hours notice. I know this spray has severely undermined my health. I believe the spray almost killed me (see my comment on the Di Marco non effect Part A). I ask Sutton to relocate my son, my surviving dog (my large dog died of liver cancer) and myself to Australia. If the government can possibly kill me on this little notice, I believe the government has a moral responsibility to assist us out of New Zealand as refugees.

Part F: Recommendations & Proposals

I believe legal action should be able to be taken against Cabinet Ministers and Maf officials.

I believe the doctors involved in the 'Spraysafe' campaign should be struck off the medical register.

I believe damages should come from these officials' personal fortunes and not from the New Zealand taxpayer.

As a teacher I believe the Ministry of Education should be sued under OSH guidelines.

I believe funeral expenses should be reimbursed. I believe the individuals responsible for the deaths should be held financially responsibly for the upkeep of the spray deads' minor children.

I believe that the onus of proof should be on the government that they did not kill us and not on us that they did.

Section 114A of the 1993 Biosecurity Act should be immediately deleted.

Research funding for all humane responses to biosecurity incursions should be increased.

Pheromone research should be ongoing for all possible moth incursions.

Border security should be humanely improved. Spraying methyl bromide under tarpaulin and hence placing port workers and neighbouring homes in danger is not good enough.

Part G: Environmental and Ecological Impacts

My plumber said that the sparrows had a disease. We were discussing the lack of sparrows in our area. My plumber (a neighbour) died later of cancer. My dog died of cancer. My neighbour's dog died of cancer. After the first spray in January 2002 I noticed: No moths of any sort. The giant spiders disappeared. The

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

giant slugs disappeared. My mouse population disappeared. The sparrows (except for one) disappeared. My garden is different now. It doesn't have butterflies (although I have occasionally seen white cabbage). It has few bees and almost no wasps. I very rarely see a giant spider; the slugs are quite small. The birds thankfully returned to their pre-spray population.

I visited my mother and aunt in east Auckland after the east Auckland spraying in 96/97. There was a noticeable lack of bird life for sometime. My aunt told me that the east Auckland sparrows had a virus.

End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 3**Exposure: lived in spray zone****Toni Long****Oral testimony: No**

Submission to Peoples Inquiry

I was adversely affected by the Painted Apple Moth spraying in West Auckland. Initially I was not sure what was causing my health problems but after a while I narrowed it down to the spray programme. I am not sure whether I was adversely affected from the first spray or if over time my intolerance increased.

I had headaches, fatigue, and bouts of diarrhoea. The headaches from memory were ongoing. The fatigue after spray day would have me in bed for a week. I slept most of the time, only getting up to do what was necessary and then heading back to bed as soon as possible. The bouts of diarrhoea were when I re-entered the spray zone on a spray day. Even though I would wait for the recommended 2 hours. No matter what length of time, if it was the same day, I would end up in the toilet at least 3 times, cleaning out (so to speak).

Relocation on spray days was helpful for my health but highly inconvenient for my life. It was a huge inconvenience for all of my family as we worked schedules around possible spray days. It was near impossible to make the simplest of appointments, such as doctor, dentist, or hair cuts, for myself, and also my children. I would not wish such a huge trial on anyone.

Since spray days I have been to a homeopath and have been treated for high sensitivities to most known pesticides and a large range of foods. This has cost me thousands of dollars and I consider that while I may have had a few sensitivities prior to the spraying, I believe the spray programme exacerbated those and added to them.

If you require any further information or clarification of the above, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Regards,

End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 4**Exposure: worked in spray area - lived in later extended spray area.****Dorothy****Oral testimony: No**

I had worn contact lenses since early 1973 but around the time of the aerial spraying, I started having problems with irritated and sticky eyes. This didn't seem to go away and I remember when I was on holiday with my youngest sister in January or February 2002, having terrible problems with my eyes.

It was only when the spraying had been in operation for some time that I realised that my eyes seemed to worsen on the "spray days". I work as a home-care worker in the Pt Chevalier, Grey Lynn, Westmere areas.

I contacted Aer'aqua Medical Services who sent me to their doctor on the 22nd May 2003. (*see Attachment 1 for the report of this visit.*) I explained that because of my job and the fact that the spray was affecting my eyes, I needed bi-focal glasses in order to carry out my job efficiently. I did not own this type of glasses as I had bi-focal contact lenses. My optometrist had quoted \$690 for such glasses.

The doctor first suggested that I change the days I worked, but because of the nature of my job this was just not possible. She then suggested that I wear a pair of goggles on the spray days. I thought that idea was ludicrous, so it was agreed that I should see a specialist, Dr ... on the 3rd June 2003. This was to establish if my eye problem was really caused by some allergic reaction. This she was able to confirm and also arranged for me to have allergy tests to try and establish if there was any other cause. None was found and so Aer'aqua agreed to pay for a new pair of graduated spectacles for me.

I have not been able to wear my contact lenses again and now have to continuously take medication for allergies.

Some 6 to 8 months later I had to approach Aer'aqua again as my natural stigmatism had returned – wearing hard contact lenses tends to alter the actual shape of the eye, and they agreed to pay for updated lenses for my glasses.

I am enclosing a copy of a very strange letter I received dated 18th December 2003. I am not sure quite what to make of it. (*see attachment 2*)

I have had another strange medical misadventure, which may or may not have anything to do with the aerial spray.

In August 2003, at the age of 53, it was discovered that I had a blocked artery to my heart and I had to have an angioplasty. The Doctors could not find any obvious cause for this. I did not smoke, and was not overweight, and did not have high blood pressure or overly high cholesterol. I had watched what I ate for years (always weight conscious) and had attended the local gym at least 4 times a week for several years. I remember when I was in hospital, one of the Doctors making a comment about me living in the aerial spray area.

I hope the information I have supplied will help with your inquiry.

Attachment 1

Aer'aqua Medical Services Report - Plan Form – outlining result of initial client visit to the service on 22.5.2003

Opinion

allergic ?irritant conjunctivitis. Suspicious of other cause (as constant) but possible spray day exacerbation.

Plan

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

1. skin tests for general air allergy (cats, mould, grass, HDM and glue) - [note: "skin tests" deleted and replaced with "RAST (can't stop antihistamines)"]
 2. we will refer to eye specialist for diagnosis
 3. general plan likely to be
 - a. excellent knowledge of spray times (eg morning calls) from us
 - b. 0800 969696 for spray dates
-

Attachment 2

Letter from Aeraqua Medical Services

Dated 18.12.2003

Dear Dorothy

RE PAINTED APPLE MOTH HEALTH SERVICE

I am happy to write to inform you that the current programme of aerial spraying in some areas previously affected by the painted apple moth is now complete. This means the end of the current aerial spray programme in your areas.

Our records show that you registered with us but have never received medical or practical support services from us.

The purpose of this letter is to let you know that the Painted Apple Moth Health Service is now closed in your area.

Thank you for registering with us.

Yours sincerely

Painted Apple Moth Health Service

Dr Francesca Kelly, MB,ChB, CCommH, FAFPHM, FRACMA
Medical Director

End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 5**Exposure: lived in spray area****Female aged 61 yrs****Oral testimony: No**

I am quite ill at the moment so this is the best I can do.

1. ME/CFS for 25 years – first 10 very ill – bedridden and/or housebound
2. Some improvement so able to care for self tho' far from well under continual medical treatment
3. Living in New Lynn during spray campaign for painted apple moth
4. Taken out by MAF when spray extended to my area – unsuitable arrangements made – extreme stress but did avoid spray days.
5. When spray zone removed to 2km away – refused relocation even after reporting symptoms – had to make own (and unsatisfactory arrangements) – extreme stress.
6. Symptoms

From start of spraying campaign – bleeding nose/ears.

From time caught up in spray:

- swollen glands,
- headaches – extreme
- burning mouth
- dizziness
- stomach problems
- worsening of ME/CFS symptoms which had been under some control.

Ongoing symptoms

- Burning mouth
- Severe pine pollen and other seasonal allergies – not had before.
- Sensitivity to drugs/foods increased. Unable to relieve hayfever symptoms because unable to tolerate drugs or nasal sprays used to relieve.
- Severe headaches and sinus problems developed after years of remission.
- Two very severe relapses of ME/CFS – the second one as bad as the initial onset of ME/CFS – still have not recovered.

I personally feel the physical and emotional effects (extreme stress) of this prolonged campaign have robbed me of any change of may condition - ME/CFS improving.

Two severe relapses after over 20 years of keeping this condition under some kind of control cannot be coincidence. I am now unable to tolerate the majority of foods and no orthodox drugs including antibiotics etc. My only hope now is to try alternative medicine, with a hope of being able to relieve some symptoms. I cannot prove the spray caused any of this but it sure as hell didn't help. The stress and disruption to someone already chronically ill was totally unacceptable.

End

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 6
Exposure: worked in extended spray area
Oral testimony: No

(WRITTEN CONSENT NOT YET GIVEN)

=====

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 7**Exposure: lived in spray area****Oral testimony: No**

New Zealand The promised land, clean and green.

We came to live in New Zealand end 1995 my husband and myself and our two sons. We were all healthy and happy to be away from a hectic and crowded Europe.

Little did we know about the spraying of almost anything that is long forbidden to be sprayed in Europe.

And then the nightmare started with the planes spraying their poison over all the innocent people of West Auckland. My whole life I had been healthy but that was soon over. Skin rashes that since then worsened into skin cancer, allergic reactions, swollen eyes and sinuses. And on top of that and because of it doctor's bills and a totally ruined immune system that turned me into a nervous wreck?.

It was like being back in Amsterdam in my childhood, with the threatening planes flying low over our heads. Wartime all over again.

Every three weeks we had to flee town, but of course the spraydrift was on everything you touched.

The medical people we tried to talk to did not take any complaint serious. Many people and most of all children were constantly ill. There was no end to it!

Clean and green New Zealand indeed
and most people I know never saw an apple moth.

End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 8**Exposure: lived in spray drift area****Cedric Power****Oral testimony: Yes**

Submission by Cedric Power to the Peoples Inquiry regarding the program of aerial spraying of the City of Waitakere for the eradication of the Apple Moth infestation.

It is very evident that MAF like every Government Department and agency somehow seem more interested in protecting the profits of vested interests they may be contracting with than in the public's health.

This, when combined with the evident reluctance of the judiciary to deal with actions against Government Department and public servants, places the general public in an invidious position of being subject to the most scandalous deprivation of the very rights that are fundamental to every citizen in what otherwise could be considered a free and democratic country.

When the outcome of an action by a group of public servants results in a serious situation demonstrably putting aside normal public health and well being, it is not sufficient for such to take shelter behind an existing agreement containing clauses to ensure the withholding of information in order to escape prosecution.

Clearly it is not sufficient for the public to have to wait for the next general election in order to effect change when in the interim the offending Government Department does what it pleases. Nor does it serve the interests of the public when actions are based upon regulations by Orders in Council that have not been subject at any stage to public scrutiny.

End

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 9
Exposure: lived in spray area
Ken Lee
Oral testimony: No

Dear Madam

Ref: Spray REPORT

This is NOT a TALE it is a re-report. The Govt. utterly and completely ignored everyone's request NOT TO SPRAY, and as it was not on them they WENT AHEAD REGARDLESS and sprayed all and everything. I phoned at the time and reported an infected throat, which was completely and utterly ignored by them. To this day my throat is NOT RIGHT and my singing – which I did a lot of – was ruined. Some compensation should be paid by those responsible. I am not saying I was a Caruso – but – I did sing solo to an audience of 2,500 in the ALBERT HALL in England. As I am now in my 85th yr. and disabled I would not be able to attend any meeting but would be grateful for my letter to be read out. Also if I were 20 yrs. younger I would take them to court and sue them for thousands.

Yours sincerely
Ken Lee

End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 10
Exposure: lived and worked in spray area
Barbara Godding D.O N.D
Oral testimony: No

November 2005
Re: Aerial Spraying Objection

I would like to register my complete dissatisfaction with the New Zealand government that should allow the spraying of undisclosed substances on the population of New Zealand.

This I believe contravenes my human rights to live in an unthreatened environment.

As a practitioner (registered Osteopath & Naturopath) I am constantly reminded that the general population has very strong feelings against this action and have seen many clients who can reiterate stories of their own health reactions to the spray. This ranges from allergy like symptoms to coughs, sore eyes, chest complaints, asthma attacks, to complete chronic fatigue symptoms.

My own experience has been worse.

My grandson was born on July 27th 2003 with Osteogenesis Imperfecta (brittle bone disease). He is 2 yrs old now and has broken 30 times. There is no genetic history and so this occurrence is unexplained He also suffers monthly from bronchiolitis that sees him regularly hospitalized.

My daughter (his mother) has suffered for nearly the entire summer with chronic chest infections both years running that she was exposed to the spray. Whilst we were not in the direct path of the spray in 2003 she once again suffered terribly for her entire pregnancy from 4 weeks gestation.

I have kept his unhealthy placenta frozen in the hope that I might one day find a pathologist willing to analyse it for residues ...

SOMETHING INTERFERED WITH HIS DNA TO CAUSE THIS DISEASE.

If there is even one person made unwell by this spray ... HOW DARE THE GOVT CONTINUE THIS TYRANY

End
