

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 21**Exposure: lived and worked in spray/drift zone****Janet Robin****Oral testimony: Yes****The Peoples Inquiry into Aerial Spraying**

I started to get a bad cough, sore throat, shortness of breath, difficulty breathing, pain in the chest, asthmatic symptoms, and nose bleeds around the time of the first or second aerial spraying.

Because this happened some time ago now, my memory of dates is not as precise as it would have been closer to the time. I may have been away down South for one of the sprays, perhaps the first or second one. I do know that whilst driving on the motorway one morning whilst the spraying was happening, (I think I may have been fleeing the spraying but not getting away in time, since it was so early in the morning, without proper warning) - I got the above symptoms.

And another time I got them was after I sat at the grounds next to the Waikemete Cemetery, soon after a major spray, at a rally. I also got them after hosing down my house, and receiving some of the water droplets in my face; which I only did a couple of times, for that reason. The asthma continued to plague me throughout the entire time of the spraying, and for months after, but I had never had asthma before the spraying. I had also not had a nose bleed since my childhood years, when I only ever had one about three times in my memory. I had to use Ventolin and other inhalers, which I had never needed to use before. The pain and tightness in the chest was very severe and the lack of oxygen felt like I was suffocating. I woke in the night with asthmatic symptoms. My cats also started coughing a lot.

I had the asthma worst during the spraying time, then it would return in intensity in the cold winter weather. This happened for the two winters following the spraying summers 2003 and 2004. I have noticed that this winter (2005) with no spraying this summer the asthma has hardly returned, it is there a little bit, but hasn't been bad enough for me to have to use an inhaler, though I almost did once or twice; so it hasn't completely gone.

Soon after I returned from down south, in January 2003, which I think was just after a spray, I had a very intense headache/migraine, the likes of which I have never had before or since in my life. It was so bad that I had to lie down without movement (except for going to the toilet) for three to four days, drinking only water. I could not move, because of the pain. During this time I developed a blood clot in my leg (Deep Vein Thrombosis.) The consequence of this was that I was instructed to take warfarin for 6 months and developed stomach ulcers. I believe that the initial severe headache/migraine was caused by the residue of the spray; and that it is possible that the spray also played a part in (either) the blood clotting in my leg, and/or later bleeding inside my stomach. (I also had bleeding from the bowel during this period, which the spray may also have contributed to).

If the spray caused the initial migraine, (which I believe it did); it is then also at least indirectly responsible for the blood clots (due to no movement) and the ulcerative bleeding responses to the warfarin which was prescribed to treat the blood clots. After the first one or two sprays, where I evacuated myself to a café for the day I applied to be evacuated and was put on the breakfast programme and later got a hotel room. This was a major disruption and stress in my life; the lack of telephone or internet facilities causing me a lot of financial strain and interruption of important work I was doing. It interfered with important social connections, including with a family from Australia that had planned to stay with me. The fact that one would not know right up till about half an hour when the spraying started, (usually about 4.30 am in the morning); was incredibly stressful and disruptive.

I met many people whilst evacuating who had very severe health problems. One woman eventually died from liver failure. Another woman who was pregnant received droplets of spray from an aerial spraying plane whilst at a supposedly safe café right next the Whenuapai airport where the planes were taking off from! She had an instant dangerous response, with her throat and tongue instantly inflamed, and ulcerous. Another woman was a severe asthmatic whose life was in danger from the spraying, including any residue that would be there after the spraying.

I have been informed that a young woman student at Kelston Girl's High died, and that others had miscarriages; and that the miscarriage rate in the area increased dramatically during the spraying period. Many people were forced to move home altogether. I was told that a teacher at one of the local High schools also died from spraying related problems. His unusual disease was reported in the local paper, as he was appealing for a man to be a mentor for his boys after he died. Some people, such as a receptionist at the Natural health Clinic, who has long-standing asthma, and was not assertive and did not ask to be evacuated; simply suffered increased asthmatic symptoms in silence. Even an officer at WINZ in Henderson told me how her child had severe asthmatic problems whenever spraying occurred.

The response from the official medical officers doctors and nurses, employed by Aer Aqua was one of scepticism and refusal to validate that any of the symptoms were spray related, even though they must have had hundreds of reports. One nurse used the post- modern language of subjectivism (.. everybody has their own reality.) (people "believe" they have these problems..) to completely invalidate the possibility any kind of scientific empirical objective reality being described. I believe that the Aer Aqua staff had conflicts of interest, as the entire business had the purpose of first of all continuing to deny that any health damage was happening; whilst at the same time taking care of the needs of people whose health was damaged or at threat; and thirdly receiving 10 million dollars to do this job from the Govt. So it was in their interests for the spraying to continue, so that they would have the contract; and at the same time to keep denying that any real health problem existed, since this was the government line.

This dual government line, that the spray was safe, at the same time as looking after people with medical problems, was itself a contradiction exposing the dishonesty of their position. The Govt's refusal to reveal the contents of the spray which they forced upon entire populations against their will was scandalous. At the same time the Govt (Annette King [Health Minister]) itself admitted that around 6 (?) percent of the population would have health problems as a result of the spray. This meant it was knowingly harming the health of about 20,000 people (I think this was the calculation I made at the time) – (in any case a large number.)

I have suffered chemical poisoning from improperly used carpet cleaning chemicals in the past, which had caused me severe coughing at the time (but not on-going asthma) and some other health problems, and forced me to move house; and since this time I have been chemically sensitive such as to the preservatives or scents used in hairsprays shampoos, nail polish etc. I have experienced liver pain dizziness and sickness from car exhaust fumes; and around this time I also discovered that I had a life threatening melanoma. For these reasons I was particularly afraid as to the damage that the spraying could cause me; which is why I chose to evacuate.

However towards the end of the spraying I had a job at [...] High School which required me to attend the school even though it was in the area close to the spray zone. I may have had an increased sensitivity to the chemicals and preservatives in the spray as a result of my earlier health issues and my sensitivity to chemicals.

I think that the stress itself is a health hazard, and would possibly not evacuate should the spraying occur again; because the evacuations are too stressful and disruptive of normal productive and economic life. I received no compensation for the health problems, petrol costs, medical bills, economic disruptions and stress that was caused in my life.

I was once given a description of the ingredients of MethAmphetamine during a talk by a police officer at [...] High School, and I got the impression that these ingredients were similar to the probable ingredients of the spray (as estimated by various groups based on knowledge of similar overseas sprays.) Could be just a hunch but worth looking into.

End

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 22

Exposure: lived in spray zone (hot spot)

Grant Philpott

Oral testimony: Yes

Peoples Enquiry Testimony:

Relevant medical history:

Allergy to sodium benzoate since childhood.

Symptom - hives

Poisoning by photographic chemicals while working for the government 1983-1994

Symptoms - at the time, low resistance to colds, flu etc. tonsillitis, no energy, severe post nasal drip, and finally blistering in the nose.

Settled with Accident Compensation Corporation after two years of bitter fighting. ACC only accepted my claim after I presented them with a copy of their own publication on the effects of photo chemicals.

Tonsils removed 1996

Situation.

I live in Ranui, in West Auckland. My house was on the edge of the high intensity spray zone for Foray 48b. I have lived in the same house since 1990. During 2002 I lived and worked in the spray zone. In 2003 up until midyear, I travelled on my motorcycle through the spray to my job in the city. From mid 2003, after losing my teaching job for 'stress', I was at home during the spraying. The day after the third to last extensive spraying, I developed blistering in my nose, which faded away after a week and a half. I thought at the time it was a coincidence. After the second to last extensive spraying I got the same blistering. I then became very worried as the symptom was the same as when I had been severely poisoned by photographic chemicals.

I immediately saw my doctor who referred me on to the Governments doctors - aer aqua. The person I saw at aer aqua examined my nose and suggested that I might have herpes. I pointed out that I had never had herpes before in my life. The person then, after being told about my problems with photo chemicals, then suggested that I may have reacted to acids in the spray. Aer aqua then gave me money to leave the area during the spraying although they forgot for one targeted spray. My doctor had sent me for a blood test. This revealed that I had chronic lymphocytic leukaemia. I have no family history of leukaemia so I went through my previous blood tests. Three tests in 1997 1998 and 1999 show my lymphocyte count as being well within normal and even slightly declining. My next blood test was in 2003 when I had been put off work for 'stress'. It shows that I had just exceeded the normal range and had leukaemia. But no one noticed.

My health has steadily declined. I became concerned as the leukaemia was not advanced enough to cause any noticeable symptoms. In August 2005 I went to my doctor and then to an ear nose and throat specialist as I could feel my body shutting down. For a long time I had been suffering from anxiety attacks, had no energy, and had memory problems. Earlier this year I developed a continuing sore throat and cough.

These doctors did not know what was wrong. I then went to a men's clinic where I was tested for endocrine problems. This revealed that I had almost no DHEA and almost no testosterone. Within days of taking DHEA supplements my anxiety attacks, throat problems, and cough disappeared. I also have my strength back.

Research

On researching Foray 48b I noted that it contained sodium benzoic/benzoic acid and methyl paraben as well as hydrochloric acid and propylene glycol as part of the "inerts". Interestingly hydrochloric acid is the blistering agent in poison gases like Mustard Gas. Benzoic acid and methyl paraben (another benzoate) have been used as insecticides. Glycols are well known for their poisonous effects on animals.

These chemicals are active ingredients not inerts!

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

I think the killing power of Foray 48b is in the 'inerts'. And BTK by itself is probably useless on the painted apple moth.

Conclusion

I am probably allergic to all benzene based chemicals.

Benzoic acid/sodium benzoate caused my leukaemia as they are known to affect human lymphocytes (WHO) and I am allergic to sodium benzoate.

Methyl paraben (another benzoate) is known for endocrine disruption and would have caused my adrenal gland to stop producing DHEA. It is known to be more dangerous in small quantities.

I found out a month ago that my best friend's father died in 2003 from exactly the same endocrine symptoms as I had. The doctors at the hospital did not know what was wrong with him. Coincidentally I have met two other people recently that developed endocrine problems during the spraying. Prior to this I had never met anyone with endocrine problems. I don't like coincidences.

The undiagnosed endocrine problems probably caused my 'stress' which resulted in me losing my job.

The government lied when they stated that Foray 48b does not cause birth defects- my parents have a mutant dog gestated and born in the 1996/97 spraying. Only one other dog in the litter survived. The spray had been applied to the land behind the dog breeder's property

Actions

I submitted a compensation claim with supporting medical evidence to the Prime Minister. I received no reply. Instead, I received a letter from the current Minister of Health that made reference to the Ministry of Health as I had also written to them. No mention was made about my claim.

I received a reply from the Ministry of Health. That letter stated that the Ministry did not know what was in the spray. This was a lie as a health board report from 2002 said that the Ministry had a list of the chemicals in Foray 48b and had conducted a toxicological study on Foray 48b. I wrote back to the Minister over the Ministry lying.

I received a letter from someone further down the ladder saying that I would eventually get a reply to my questions over the Ministry lying. Again there was no mention of my claim.

The labour government deliberately sprayed us with Foray 48b which is a chemical weapon and thus a weapon of mass destruction. This is a crime punishable by life imprisonment or a one million dollar fine.

The labour government has failed to recognise my compensation claim and are now working on an 'orchestrated litany of lies'. I shall now lay a complaint with the World Court.

I wish to appear before the commissioners.

You may use my testimony to help bring the labour party to justice for the mass murder and mutilation of the people of New Zealand.

End

=====

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 23

Exposure: lived and worked in spray zone

Nicola Gee

Oral testimony: No

Testimony regarding the effects of PAM spray on my health and well-being.

I kept an "Eye Diary" from the first day I was affected by the spray – with this purpose in mind, that I would be able to have the details of what happened. I do not want to speak at the hearing.

Following is the exact transcript from this diary. It is patchy in places, but I wanted to give the exact diary notes and then explain in more depth later. The writing in blue I added just now for clarification.

EYE DIARY

23 Oct 2002 First Spray (*directly over our house between 6 and 7am*).

25 Oct 02 awoke with red, sore and oozy eyes – got antibiotic drops from my doctor that day.

Next spray: 16 or 17th Nov, (I left the house this time) and the following Sunday eyes were worse then ever. Treated with Ocuheel drops (*as I prefer to use alternative medicines*), they cleared in 2/3 days.

Next spray: 3rd Dec, eyes flared up on 7th Dec. Was sprayed on 1st Dec while going to a MAF doctor in Henderson.

Eyes flared at least once between each spray time, after clearing up. Cleared with Ocuheel.

Spraying on Sat 21st Dec:

Had to walk outside to car to go to work, which was after spraying had stopped but was still falling. The car was covered and I washed windscreen but when I got to work more was there. Also noticed burning in nose and throat while driving to work.

Awoke on Sunday with red sore and inflamed eyes.....and also skin on cheeks was red and hot.

Went to MAF doctor on 29th Dec. (*2nd time*)

Awoke on Jan 4th: eyes crusty, both red and swollen. Left eye worse. Cheeks red and hot. Also feeling unwell, no energy, fatigue, nausea. Became clear by Monday night.

Spraying week 7th Jan. Stayed overnight in Motel on 7th Jan.

Eyes clear-----

Fri night: eyes very itchy after bath, next morning eyes had flared up, very crusty and red, but not quite as red as times before. Skin on cheeks hot and red, more so as day went on. Skin became dry/rough to touch. Also sensitive around eye area. Eyes very sensitive, itchy, sore.

Takes longer for skin to clear than eyes.

On waking eyeballs feel sore with headache feeling.

30 Jan 03 spray days begun

stayed away in motel thurs night, came home fri night 7pm, eyes good.

EXTRA INFO:

Prior to this reaction, I had never had any problem with my eyes, and I have kept in good health most of my life so far.

Another symptom which I didn't mention above, was that often when I would wake up in the mornings, my eyelids would actually be 'stuck' shut, and I would have to bathe them to be able to open them properly.

The only thing that I feel may be related is I get mild hayfever in spring. But I have never had any condition or reaction like this before.

I think I stayed in a motel 3 times altogether, and I was very glad to be well out of the spray zone. It definitely helped, which confirms to me that the spray was the cause of my symptoms.

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Since this whole event I have noticed that my eyes are now quite sensitive – and become itchy quite easily in an allergic way.

Now and then I have woken with sore dry, sometimes red eyes as if they have reacted to something in the environment, even though there is no spraying at present.

The experience was also quite costly – the Ocuheel (a homeopathic preparation) was about \$20 each packet and I used about 5. Plus one doctors visit of \$50. The MAF doctor was no charge I recall, but it was a very unsatisfactory visit as she was trying to convince me that the reaction was caused by other things, and that the spray was safe and couldn't possibly have this effect.

I did receive a cheque for \$20 from MAF to cover petrol costs for going to motels.

I also worked in an area that was heavily sprayed (Cox's Bay in Westmere), and it involved night duty, so some mornings we were sprayed at work. We kept the house shut tight (as we did at home), but at some stage had to go to car, but only did this after planes had stopped.

Also I recall driving to work and being sprayed on several occasions.

I also took some days off work as I felt totally miserable with the symptoms, and was working at that time in the public eye (as a beauty therapist).

End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 24**Exposure: lived in spray and drift zone****Johannes Blaschke****Oral testimony: Yes****Testimonial for People's Inquiry into the aerial spraying campaign against the Painted Apple Moth**

I hereby give the inquiry (and all affiliated organisations/members) permission to publish the contents of this testimony and pictures of my back.

Shortly after the start of the aerial spraying I began to develop a rash that slowly progressed to cover most of my body. I also suffered from severely elevated respiratory problems that at their peak caused me to be cough phlegm that contained blood. I have attached pictures of this rash to the email containing this report.

I did not associate these symptoms with the aerial spraying because at the time I did not take any interest in the campaign and thus was unaware of when the spraying took place (also did I not imagine the scale of the operation, imagining only a few small crop dusters spraying a few fields), just knowing that 'some eradication campaign' is taking place. On these grounds I later established that my symptoms cannot be psychological.

When I told my parents of my condition they immediately postulated the connection between my rash (which at that stage was very severe) and contacted the MAF doctor in our area. This doctor quickly agreed with my parent's opinion.

Considering the severity of my condition it was considered that the best course of action is that I be evacuated from the spray area (and drift zone) to a motel close to my school in Albany.

After being evacuated during spraying my symptoms then rapidly improved with the rash being nearly entirely healed approximately one month later. Also my respiratory symptoms only returned if I had to enter the spray zone for a brief period.

MAF (and any other organisations affiliated to the evacuation programme) was quite co-operative at the beginning of the campaign with their call centre and medical staff seemingly being concerned for the wellbeing of the people in the area being sprayed.

However towards the end of the campaign (the final few months), the medical staff were claiming I suffered from psychological symptoms and that I am no longer going to be evacuated. I still do not think that this hypothesis is valid since my symptoms started without me being unaware that the spraying was taking place in my area. Also I do not have a phobia for low flying aeroplanes (as the medical staff suggested).

From that point onwards the medical staff were so uncooperative that it seemed like they were deliberately making it difficult for me to be evacuated. In one incident me being informed that I used one of my taxi-vouchers outside the spray-dates and that I am to reimburse them for that taxi fare. Even though this was entirely untrue and after informing them that the late date was due to a repeatedly postponed aerial spraying they withdrew their claim.

Also the MAF helpline staff was unable to supply me with a map of the northern spray zone, even after I informed them that I go to school near there. Instead I received multiple copies of the West Auckland sections of the spray zone citing that I won't need that map since I live in near Henderson.

In general the behaviour of the medical/MAF staff that I had to deal with was increasingly rude and belittling as time progressed.

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate



End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 25**Exposure: lived in spray zone****Bryan Pulham****Oral testimony: No**

I have been living in the heart of Ranui throughout the period when the spraying program was extended to here. At first I did not consider that I had any side effects, but then I came to realise that I was living in a semi permanent state of not feeling as well as I should. The symptoms were that of a low grade throat infection and during periods when I was feeling worst I had what I would describe as head colds - with running nose, frequent sneezing and low energy.

For two years running, I was at the annual work Xmas BBQ, where I took care to stay away from the frivolity and the swimming pool because I was cold (where others were stripped to the waist and / or in the pool) and sensed that if I got wet or thrown in the pool (as others were) I would have become very cold and ill.

I am normally a healthy person; I rarely take sick days off work and rarely visit the doctor so I'm not very good at describing illness or noticing symptoms. Towards the end of the aerial spraying program, I realised that I was sneezing around privet and up to then I had never suffered from allergies or been susceptible to the smell of privet.

It is quite predictable that the health department and vested interests will claim that there is no link between my experience and the spraying program but I believe it is more than a coincidence, that over the last year, the symptoms have imperceptibly gone away.

End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 26

Exposure: border infested zone

Mrs C. de Graaf

Oral testimony: no

Dear Sir/ madam

My reason for opposing to any more insect spraying (esp from the air) is mainly for health reasons.

For the last 12 years I have suffered from ME/CFS. That means that any bad chemical I inhale, eat, or get on to my skin affects my immune system (as well as my nervous system) and makes me worse. I can't even use a flyspray in my house.

ME/CFS is a serious illness (in fact it is bl... Hell) and there is no cure available.

I am a member of the "ANZME Society" and know that there are many people with this condition in Auckland (and about 8,000 in the whole of NZ). Because of this illness and constant exhaustion I'll have nowhere to go to if any spraying from the air will happen in my area, or further away.

So please, don't you think that the health and welfare of people is more important than a few more or less insects on trees around?

I see this aerial spraying as a very inconsiderate, irresponsible and stupid act from MAF.

Thank you for reading this submission, and say NO to aerial spraying.

Sorry I don't have the energy etc to come to the Inquiry, it would be too tiring and stressful to me, including the traveling

End

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 27

Exposure: intensive spray zone

M.L. Dunkley

Oral testimony: no

Submission is two letters written nearly four years apart. Beginning and end of the campaign.

Letter 1 - Written 19.3.02

I am glad to have the opportunity to air my views on the subject of aerial spraying!

Spray 1. I was away from my property. When I returned and opened the gate, I felt a very light 'spray' falling gently on my hair and face and the top of the car gathered a very light film of something or other. Phoned my neighbour who says that the spraying had taken place and finished ca 25 mins earlier. Apart from sore eyes and sore neck glands, and stuffed sinuses later on, I had no major symptoms.

Spray 2. I stayed indoors and had blinds down, blocked off door and vent of the Masport fireplace, and louvres in toilet.

Helicopter came at tree top over my and adjacent properties TWICE (despite advice from MAF that it would never be done) and sprayed my house and garden twice. (no caterpillar had ever been found here by the MAF sleuths!)

I stayed indoors for the required 2 hours, by the end of which I was so ill that I could not even go and inspect the garden. Sore glands again (neck), red and sore eyes, trouble seeing (as through a film); blocked sinuses and a curious feeling of lethargy I had not experienced before, except when exposed to housepaint to which I am allergic (and from which I strictly keep away).

There was also a nasty smell all over the house. It is an oldish house as most in this area, it has wood joinery which obviously is not absolutely draft proof. This smell was 'dead', meaning it was unidentifiable. There were also 'particles' (my word) of something or other floating in the air where the sun was shining through the windows. The 2nd spraying took place on February 18th. It took me three whole weeks for the symptoms to disappear almost entirely - but at what price.

In the garden: I watched with horror as the CESTRUM which had just burst into flower out of season, such wonderful orange clusters, literally wilt before my eyes - that is, the blooms. They never recovered. The next day they were as dead and limp as the dodo. (I took a sample). - and I mention also the tender plants like begonias - they all died except one. And 2 rosetrees develop suddenly and at the same time, peculiar brownish leaves.

I put the above down to the DOUBLE DOSE OF SPRAY I receive, courtesy of MAF. My immediate neighbour can testify to the double spraying, she got her share too.

Birds: after spraying 1, the birds cease to come and keep the garden free of pests. At times we used to have 100 to 150 birds here every evening. The dawn chorus has also gone. I had listened to it every morning for over 30 years. Now only ducks are present, being fed on properties for the first year that I can remember. And the tough pukekos.

Pets: they just seem to disappear and come back. The noise of the low-flying helicopter drives them mad.

As for me and my property: I feel violated, watched over, taken over, spied upon, one just waits for the next blow to come, so-to-speak. I do understand that the weather is dictating days and times of spraying, but then it takes 3 days for the spray to be done - and poor Kelston is always at the end of it. During the waiting time: we wait; cannot go shopping just in case; cannot work in the garden, just in case; keep all windows shut tight, just in case; and we wait. At times another helicopter passes over and we panic; we phone MAF; no, 'not ours' they say. We plan to leave the house for a while: WHERE TO GO?? Many old people live alone, some have no car. Where do you want them to go? And when? Everyday, go 'somewhere' just in case?? I am only expressing, by 'we' the sorrow of many other people I know.

Well, while I type, the 3rd spraying has started early this morning. MAF on the phone say they don't know if Kelston will be sprayed today, Waikumete Cemetery is being 'done' at the moment. Phone again, they say. Meantime I live in a tightly shut house, getting claustrophobic by the minute. The drift from the Waikumete spraying came early here. Despite everything shut, the dead smell is back. I phone a friend. 'get out', she says. OK. IF I GET OUT, and they don't spray, do I do the same again, and again, until they spray? Is this my life? I am nearly 85 years old. I would love to spend my last years as a human being, not a hunted animal.

Sorry I spewed it all out. I guess it is more for my benefit, than yours. Perhaps I feel better about it, than half an hour ago.

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Damnation! The Black Bird is back in the sky. False alarm, he does not spray and relieve us of our anguish; just passing by and turning. Well, tomorrow perhaps? Perhaps. Meantime, let's cope with the drift. And be sick.

Questions:

1. Has anyone ever assessed the level of toxin in closed dwellings? And how long it takes to be clear of it?
 2. Has any Agency the right of interfering with built-up property (as opposed to gardens etc) by spraying the roof? Without the consent of the owner?
-

Letter 2 - Written 25.10.05

I have followed with much interest the campaign reviving the APPLE MOTH saga. So at long last, we made it, who would have believed it: a whole page in the Weekend HERALD recently!

I would have liked to take an active part in this endeavour, but have had severe health problems over the past weeks and having reached the great age of 88+, decided to retire (hopefully: gracefully!).

You may recall that I gave your young Dutch friend 9/10 of my Apple Moth file, keeping your Report and other valuable documents.

What I could not give away was the aftermath of the spraying campaign. Would you believe that I still cower away at the first sound of a helicopter flying overhead! I remember only too well how the machines were buzzing over my property and next door's, at tree top (we had photographs). After we were told that this 'corridor' (over our two properties) was the point when the 'copters turned around, I questioned the double dose of spray we were receiving. The answer: 'the supply is turned off, therefore there is no spraying'. Retrospectively it would be interesting to go into the dynamics of spray on/spray off v. speed and v. pilot decision!

All I know is that in my garden I lost: all roses; ALL HERBS; all vegetables. All I remember is the agony of being in a house full of the most awful smell although all windows were closed. And the terrible time when I came back from the 'safe place' provided for some of us – and the venue had been changed and had not been notified – and at the precise moment I got out of the car to open my gate, guess what? The d.helicopter zoomed overhead exactly where I stood and drenched me. By the time I made it to the shower the exposed skin was burning. Then I had to clean the car, there was goo-ey stuff on the top which resisted detergent.

Still, this is minor compared to what has happened to others. Our misfortune in this area was that Waikumete Cemetery was a prime target and as the crow flies (if there are any crows left) there would not even be 1k between us.

Apart from WW11 – I was 22 when war was declared – the AP was my worst memory. I measure my words. I spent 13 years in different countries in Africa. But of course the apologists would be quick to say 'oh yes, but you were young then, you are old now and can't take the strain'!

With all good wishes.

End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 28**Exposure: worked in spray zone****Annette Ashley****Oral testimony: yes**

I feel there are too many testimonies from people who claim their health was adversely affected during and after the Painted Apple Moth spraying for the Government to ignore these people. Obviously there are many people who are allergic to components in this spray. I for one have had so many problems during and after the spray programme. There was no obvious suggestions for why I suffered repeated swollen glands in my neck, repeatedly prescribed antibiotics and was weak, had constant red and sore eyes, sore throats, breathing difficulties and aches. I visited the MAF appointed Doctor too little avail. They referred me to a couple of Doctors and one did an allergy test specific to skin reaction to chemicals in the spray. I did not show an obvious rash however the doctor advised me this did not preclude my symptoms being related to the Painted Apple Moth Spray.

The Governments numerous claims as to why they can substantiate further spraying are contradictory to many other stances around risk taking for the general public. We are advised according to overseas studies the spray is safe. People sprayed with Agent Orange were also advised this was safe at the time. I have listened to everything that has been discussed and all the propoganda distributed to substantiate the spray programme. There appears to be scant regard for what appears to have been a great deal of human suffering both physically and mentally. I cried when the planes sweep over- head and I for one feel felt all my rights were invalid again the needs of the Governments agenda. This is NOT OK

The most negative result for me as result of all the unexplained sickness resulted in a years wasted study. I was at the end of my first year of Social Work studies and had been on a two and half month work placement. I felt so disempowered from unexplained symptoms which reoccurred again and again and I could not physically complete the remaining three weeks of my years study. I became so incredibly weak, had swollen glands, red eyes and felt absolutely stupid as no-one could provide an explanation to me as to why I suffered these reoccurring systems of varying intensities. I am unable to describe how disappointing this whole episode has been for me personally. Unless such occurrences personally affect prominent politicians they will not change their views while for so many of us we appear to be an expendable commodity in the intent to eradicate bugs.

The irony of the way the Government gave me the opportunity to study for almost a year with the assistance of a Student Loan of \$10,500.00 then sprayed me repeatedly (it was all over my face and skin when work experience took me into the field) makes for some bittersweet and angry feelings of the injustice of everything. I am no wiser now than before and I have no scientific evidence to support my theories the Painted Applemoth Spray Programme directly contributed to my becoming so ill again and again. History is full of stories from authorities claiming, "but we did not know"!

End

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 29**Exposure: spray zone****Oral testimony: no**

Since 1990 I have suffered from the illness chronic fatigue syndrome or M.E. Unfortunately with the illness there is any number of things which can cause relapses putting the patient back to square one.

One of the triggers to set off relapses in my case is that I am very allergic to any sprays at all. If I drive past an orchard or vineyard that has been sprayed I can get a relapse which can mean a week in bed before I recover from it.

The spray doesn't have to be of a toxic nature for me to be allergic to it. For example I'm very allergic to hair sprays and fly sprays. Also I am very allergic to soya which is one of the spray ingredients in the PAM spray. No doubt there are other ingredients in the spray which I am also allergic to.

Before the aerial spraying started initially, my wife and I went to England in July 2000. This involved considerable expense seeing a Harley Street specialist in fatigue disorders, in a desperate attempt to try to improve my quality of life which was very poor, for example I was unable to dry myself after having a shower. I had to sit on a stool while my wife dried me.

The doctor was able to give me some treatment which improved my health to some extent. When we returned to NZ, we sold our house in Titirangi then bought a new house with a smaller section in Henderson. This was in November 2001.

In January 2002 the aerial spraying for the PAM started. We were completely unaware of the spraying campaign as nothing would have induced us to have purchased a house in the Henderson area if we had known. After enquires we found that MAF paid motel expenses for at risk people like myself to stay out of the area when the spraying was to be done.

However our life style became very disrupted every three weeks with MAF phoning us at about 5am to tell us if the spraying was to take place that day or not, if so we would then leave for a motel.

At this stage I was able to cope, we would return home the day after the spraying was completed.

While the spraying wasn't over our house or grounds during this period I needed the extra time away owing to my extreme sensitivity to any sprays whether toxic or not as just the smell would make me very ill.

When MAF decided to do the blanket spraying, my wife and I were extremely worried about how this would affect my illness, but we had no options. We were relocated as usual when the blanket spraying was done.

When we returned home the next day the house smelt strongly of spray inside, even when all the doors and windows were opened. The house is new with aluminium windows and doesn't have a chimney so it's a puzzle how the spray smell could infiltrate it. I sat in the house for three hours feeling sicker and sicker. Even going outside I could smell the strong smell of the spray on the lawns, trees, and garden. I said to my wife I have got to go back to the motel as I am feeling very ill, this was on a Friday.

Over the weekend I was very nauseous and weak, my heart was racing on occasions. Monday morning I went to my doctor who promptly gave me a medical check up and an ECG but found nothing wrong with my heart thankfully, but said it must be the spray that made me so ill.

I spent time staying at an economical cabin in a low cost camping ground at Orewa till the spray smell around the outside of our house abated.

My wife and I decided we would have to leave the Henderson area until the blanket spraying was completed which was estimated to be eighteen months to two years away. After extreme difficulty because of new immigrants we managed to rent a flat within our means in Papatoetoe.

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

The flat was shabby, about forty years old with the usual bits and pieces not working properly, however we were very grateful to get it. We managed to rent our Henderson house out so this covered the rent for the flat. We were in this flat which we felt was far below our living standard for two years before we were able to return to our Henderson house when MAF completed the blanket spraying.

We hope if you get a response from enough affected people like us we might be able to form a group and consider seriously taking court action against MAF for compensation. There must be grounds against human rights, my health getting worse during the blanket spraying, excessive stress which I am supposed to avoid, plus having to live in a grotty flat for two years. We are retired so the flat was all we could afford.

If there are any points in my letter you would like more detail on I could elaborate more on them. I am sorry the letter is so long. My wife and I are very pleased there is to be a public inquiry into the aerial spraying operation as we feel MAF has been very heavy handed about it.

End

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Submission to People's Inquiry – No 30

Exposure: spray zone

Christina Closs

Oral testimony: No

To whom it may concern

I stay in the RSA village in Te Atatu which was sprayed constantly during the MAF spraying as there are two reserves next to us. On my morning walk I got caught in the midst of the spray. I felt very ill afterwards and had to see my doctor who immediately gave me oxygen. He took my blood pressure and said it was very high. I told him to check his computer as I had never had high blood pressure. He said I had asthma as well as another illness I had never suffered from. I contacted the MAF clinic and they told me to stay in on the spraying days. Close my windows and not go out for a couple of hours. Now they are saying they told me to stay in the house because of my asthma which I didn't have before the spraying. I contacted my MP, Chris Carter and his secretary sent my details to Jim Sutton in the beehive. (*Correspondence appended below*). I was sent to see two specialists [MAF doctors] and they said it wasn't the spray that caused my illness it was my age. I gave both of them permission to get my medical files from my Dr but they did not do so. I have always kept good health and my Dr hardly saw me, now I have to be on medication for the rest of my life. I was given a medical alarm from Kiwi Concern as I live alone and don't know when I am going to take an attack. I am glad now that all the people in west Auckland who were affected by the spray have this chance to tell their story.

Appendix 1.

Letter from Electorate Secretary of the Hon Chris Carter MP to the Compensation Co-ordinator MAF. 13.7.04

Re: Complaint by Christina Closs of RSA Village, of ill health arising from Apple Moth Spraying of the Te Atatu area on or around the 3rd December 2002.

Mrs. Closs has asked the office of the Hon Chris Carter MP to assist with a query regarding compensation for ill health experienced since the first apple moth spray operation over her residence.

Mrs. Closs advises that that on, or around the 3rd December 2002, she was taking her daily walk near her home at the RSA Village. During her walk the first apple moth spray operation in the area commenced, coating her in spray.

Mrs. Closs advises that, by the time she arrived home she was breathless and felt very unwell. She visited her doctor, Dr RM, at the Henderson medical centre who immediately gave her oxygen. Her blood pressure was taken and was found to be very high.

Mrs. Closs advises that she had never previously experienced asthma or high blood pressure. She has been a patient of Dr RM for some time (and prior was a patient of Dr HW at the Glendene Medical centre until his retirement.

Mrs. Closs telephoned the MAF Apple Moth Spray Helpline following her reaction and was told to keep inside with doors and windows closed throughout further spraying. MAF undertook to telephone her on the morning of any spray operation (and did so). Despite taking these precautions, Mrs. Closs' symptoms remained. Mrs. Closs has been seen by two MAF doctors, Dr [...] and Dr [...] and advised that her age is at the root of her problems, rather than the initial spray burst that she received.

Mrs. Closs is now on a variety of medication, including: Amitrip, Flixotide, Ventolin, and Bendro Fluazide. This medication costs her \$30 on a three-monthly basis. Her doctor advises her that she will likely need this medication for the rest of her life.

Mrs. Closs is extremely unhappy that she will need to take medication from now on. She advises that she has never liked to take any form of medication and has led a hale and hearty life. Subsequent to the initial spraying she advises that she had not experienced any asthma or high blood pressure. Mrs. Closs is also extremely unhappy that she will need to pay for the medication that she is now being required to take.

Please treat this information with respect, and honour the privacy of everyone who has had the courage to participate

Mrs. Closs believes that her health problems arose as a consequence of the initial MAF Apple Moth spray circa 3rd December 2002. To that end, she would like to be compensated for the doctor's fees and prescription charges that she has paid since that date. She advises that, after initial payment of \$30, her doctor very kindly treated her for free for the first six weeks, but from that time on Mrs. Closs has paid \$30 for visits and medication on a three monthly cycle. From January 2003, this amounts to some \$210.00 (being seven visits @ \$30).

Further, Mrs. Closs is very aggrieved that she should have to continue to pay \$30 every three months in future, and also asks for compensation by way of MAF paying for future medication and visit costs, connected with her health issues arising from the first apple moth spray, as they arise.

Please consider and investigate this request for compensation on behalf of Mrs. Closs.

Encl. copy of privacy waiver signed by Mrs. Closs. (Mrs. Closs advises that she has previously supplied permission for MAF to view all her medical records).

Appendix 2

Letter from the Electorate Secretary to Hon Chris Carter MP to Mrs. Closs. Dated 11.8.04

Re your complaint of ill health arising from Apple Moth Spraying of the Te Atatu area on or around the 3rd December 2002.

The office of the Hon. Chris Carter has received a reply to your complaint regarding ill health arising from Apple Moth spraying from the Minister for Biosecurity, the Hon Jim Sutton. A copy of this reply* is enclosed for your information and records.

The Minister advises that the Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries (MAF) officials believe that the assessment made by two doctors provided by their health service is correct. In short, it appears the Minister is not prepared to direct funding on past or future doctor's visits or medication.

I am sorry that this response has not been more favourable for you. Please don't hesitate to contact this office if you feel we can be of assistance in any other matters.

**letter from Minister for Biosecurity, Hon Jim Sutton to Chris Carter MP dated 10.8.04*

Dear Chris

I am responding to your electorate Secretary's letter of 13 July 2004 outlining the complaint of Mrs. Closs with respect to compensation for ill health experienced since the first painted apple moth aerial operation.

From December 2001 to June 2004 the Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries (MAF) provided a health service for the community. Mrs. Closs registered with that health service in December 2002 and was assessed by two of the most experienced doctors in the service. They determined that her condition was not spray related and advised her to this effect. For this reason [MAF] Dr [...] declined to fund Mrs. Closs repeated visits to her own general practitioner.

MAF officials advise that they are confident that in assessing Mrs. Closs the health service has acted appropriately.

APPENDIX 3

Letter from Mrs. Closs to Hon Jim Sutton, Minister for Biosecurity – dated 9.11.2004

Dear Jim Sutton

In answer to your reply concerning the letter about my state of health, I don't care what you or anyone says the [MAF] spraying was detrimental to the people's health in West Auckland. I for one have never had asthma or high blood pressure in my life and my doctor hardly saw me as I kept very good health now I am never away from him as I will be on medication for the rest of my life. My grandson and great grandson came to visit me one day from Remuera and were sprayed on coming out of the car. Both of them were ill for six weeks. My other grandsons wife was pregnant at the time of the spraying and when the baby was born she the baby cried for three weeks day and night after she was seen by a couple of specialists who could not make out what was wrong with her. Her mother took her to another Dr and he found the child was born with a hernia and she had to have an operation. You were saying that [MAF] provide a health service for the community well the only help I and loads of other people in the west was to close our windows and doors and not to go out for a couple of hours after the spraying. I gave the health service permission to contact my doctor and look over my medical files. I asked my doctor did anyone do so and he said no but the MAF doctor did phone him and said it was not the spray that caused my illness. I read in the newspaper that there was 90 million dollars given to [MAF] to spray and out of that 10 million to go to the people who were affected by it. I asked the MAF doctor about it and he said that the money went to nurses and Drs who were manning the phones so the powers that be must have known there would be a lot of sick people in the west. I only hope there will be no more spraying as I wouldn't wish the way I have felt and still feel on my worst enemy. Even the birds disappeared and they have a great sense of danger but thank god they are back and I can feed them again. I must say that the two Drs I saw must have x-ray eyes to just take one look at me and say it wasn't the spray that made me ill. The first one I saw I made him examine me and I questioned him if he was a Dr I had my doubts. There is a sin to answer here and it will eventually come out in the open. I hope you all rest easy.

End
